

TRANSFORMATION OF ADULTS AS TRANSFORMATIONAL LEARNERS

Mehmet Üçler İlik¹, Olga Pregl², Nikola Polakova³, Hanna Urbanovich⁴

Abstract: The aim of this study is to investigate how transformational learning, which is within the scope of adult education (andragogy), takes place in the lives of adults who are transformational learners. In this qualitative study conducted according to the phenomenological approach, the participants were eight adults from the cities of Izmir-Turkey, Bratislava-Slovakia, Cersak-Slovenia and Lecce-Italy. In the study, data were obtained by the interview technique used in qualitative research. An adult interview form with transformational learning experience consisting of semi-structured questions was used to collect data. Descriptive analysis technique was used in the analysis of the data, and the phases of transformational learning theory and themes from the transformational learning conceptual framework were determined, the findings were defined and interpreted in accordance with the aims and sub-objectives of the research. In the research, it was found that adults went through a transformation process in line with the theoretical information obtained in the literature, experienced a dilemma before the transformation, gained a new perspective by criticizing the sources of feelings, thoughts and references they had in their previous lives, benefited from the experiences of people who went through this process, developed critical thinking skills, mostly made a plan, acquired new knowledge and skills, acquired new roles according to their experiences, and it is understood that they have adopted a new worldview. The adults in the study stated that they were caused by a crisis, hurt or bad living conditions in their lives to enter the transformation process, and that they gained a more understanding, positive and peaceful view of life after the transformation. It is thought that the obtained data will contribute to the development of adult learning programs, the contribution of adult learning institutions to educational activities, researchers who will conduct research on adult learning and the literature in more detailed examination of transformational learning in adult learning.

Keywords: Adult Education, Transformational Learning, Perspective Transformation, Experience, Critical Thinking, Adult Learning

INTRODUCTION

Learning is at the center of every human life. After people complete compulsory education, the need to be a self-actualized individual in social life and the changing environment require the continuity of the learning process. People who are educated in formal education institutions throughout their compulsory education life want to continue learning for different reasons. The concept of Lifelong Learning, in which pedagogy and andragogy coexist, also reveals that learning continues throughout life. The importance of adult learning continues to increase across the globe and has therefore become a learning in which government governments allocate more financial resources. The European Commission has declared lifelong learning as "a strategy to become the world's most competitive and dynamic knowledge-based economy" (European Commission, 2002: 1). In order to achieve this goal, it is recommended that Europe's education and training systems adapt to the demands of the information society by providing learning and qualification opportunities: "Lifelong learning is an inclusive strategy of European cooperation in education and training policies and for the individual. The lifelong learning approach is a key policy strategy for the development of citizenship, social cohesion, employment and individual fulfillment" (European Commission, 2002: 4).

In contemporary life, the need for learning from birth to death of people has led to the emergence of learning theories that are constantly developing and need to develop. Studies on adult learning have shown that adults learn differently from children. What a person wants to learn, what is offered to him/her, and the ways in which he/she learns are largely determined

¹ *Güzelbahçe Halk Eğitimi Merkezi, İzmir, Türkiye, mehmetuclerim@yahoo.com*

² *Vedoma, Cersak, Slovenia, olga.pregl@siol.net*

³ *TopCoach, Bratislava, Slovakia, nikolapolakova@topcoach.sk*

⁴ *EduVita, Lecce, Italy, eduvita.it@gmail.com*

by the nature of society at a given time (Merriam, Caffarella, & Baumgartner, 2007). One of the most well-known theories about adult learning is Knowles' "Andragogy" theory. Knowles' assumptions about adult learning are: 1. The need to know, 2. Learners' self-perception, 3. The role of learners' lives, 4. Readiness to learn, 5. Orientation to learn, and 6. Motivation (Knowles, 1996). These assumptions about adult learning can be explained as follows (Knowles, 1996; Knowles, Holton, & Swanson, 2015):

1. Adults want to know why they need to learn something before they can start learning it. Therefore, the first task of the facilitator (facilitator is used instead of educator or teacher) is to help learners become aware of their need to know.

2. Adults take responsibility for their own decisions and lives and are self-directed individuals. For this reason, it should not be ignored that adults are self-directed learners when organizing learning experiences.

3. Adults have a rich accumulation of experiences. However, the type of experiences they have also been different. Experiences that differ in quality and quantity in adult learning have various consequences for adult education.

4. Adults are ready to learn what they need to know, and they do so in order to deal with real-life problems. Developmental tasks linked to moving from one developmental stage to the next are a rich source of readiness to learn.

5. Adults' learning orientation is life- or task/problem-oriented. For this reason, new learning helps the adult to fulfill their duties in life or to cope with the problems they face, making it easier for them to participate in the learning process.

6. Although adults react to some external motivators (promotion, wages, etc.), the strongest motivators are internal pressures (job satisfaction, increased self-confidence, etc.).

Professor Peter Jarvis (1959), an international expert in the fields of lifelong learning, adult and continuing education, has put human experiences at the heart of learning. Jarvis theorized that all learning begins with the five human senses of sound, sight, smell, taste, and touch (Merriam et al., 2007). People have learning experiences using these five senses throughout life, but incompatibilities may occur when they encounter them in life as a result of learning experiences. This is articulated by Jarvis as follows: "Incongruity occurs when our biographical repertoire is no longer sufficient to automatically cope with our situation, so that our unconsidered harmony with our world is to some extent disrupted" (Jarvis, 2006: 9). "Now that previous learning is not able to cope with the current situation, people are aware that they do not consciously know how to behave. Learning always begins with experience" (Jarvis, 2004: 93). This "mindless, instinctive inability to deal with the situation is at the heart of all learning." (Jarvis, 1987: 35). The accumulation of knowledge and experience that is the basis of practice often leads to thinking about how what we know can come together to form a kind of explanatory framework (Merriam et al., 2007).

The theory of adult learning that has been emphasized in recent years and is based on this research is the *Transformational Learning Theory*. Mezirow (1978) conducted a qualitative study to identify the factors that characteristically hinder or facilitate women's advancement in college readmission programs. In this study, he concluded that "*perspective transformation*" is the central process in the personal development of women returning to university. Mezirow realized that with the contribution of university education, women began to look critically at their social roles, which they internalized and accepted as unquestionable, and developed a new perspective by taking more autonomy, control and responsibility for their own lives (Mezirow, 1978). As a result of his research with 83 women, Mezirow listed the transformation of women's perspectives in 10 phases. (Mezirow, 1978a, 1978b, 1981: 7, 1991, 2000: 22; 2018: 94) (Table 1.).

Table 1.
The Phases of of Mezirov's Perspective Transformation.

Phases
1. A disorienting dilemma.
2. A self-examination with feelings of guilt or shame.
3. A critical assessment of epistemic, sociocultural, or psychic assumptions.

4. *Recognition that one's discontent and the process of transformation are shared and that others have negotiated a similar change.*
 5. *Exploration of options for new roles, relationships, and actions.*
 6. *Planning of a course of action.*
 7. *Acquisition of knowledge and skills for implementing one's plans.*
 8. *Provisional trying of new roles.*
 9. *Building of competence and self-confidence in new roles and relationships.*
 10. *A reintegration into one's life on the basis of conditions dictated by one's perspective.*
-

Transformational Learning Theory (DOC) is built on both humanist and structuralist assumptions (Taylor and Cranton, 2013). From a psychological point of view, humanism asserts that human nature is inherently good and that human beings are free and autonomous beings. The emphasis is on the self; the self has the potential for growth, development, and self-actualization that contributes to the well-being of humanity as a whole (Merriam and Brockett, 1997). Constructivism comes from the work of Piaget (1964), Dewey (1986), and others.

According to Mezirov, transformation theory is a constructivist theory of adult learning, and the main target audience is adult educators (Mezirov, 1991). As a constructivist theory, it seeks to find a general, concise and ideal model that explains the comprehensive structure, dimensions and dynamics of the learning process (Mezirow, 1996). In the field of adult education, Candy's (1991) groundbreaking work on **self-directed learning** was written from a constructivist perspective. In a broad sense, according to vonstruivism, learning is the process of creating meaning from experience. TLT takes a constructivist perspective on how people make sense of their experiences and uses Habermas' theory of communicative action, which expresses three types of learning (instrumental, communicative, and liberating).

Darkenwald and Merriam (1982) state that although adults have their own characteristics, they have high energy levels, are willing and open to learning. Other factors that can positively or negatively affect learning include life experiences and professional skills. This factor can have a positive effect as well as a negative one.

Mezirov based the concept of transformative learning on the theory of communicative learning, *which argues that individual communication has a meaning beyond words* (Chaves, 2008: 8). Communicative learning focuses on concepts such as freedom, justice, love, work, autonomy, reconciliation, and democracy, through which people communicate their feelings, needs, values, and desires (Taylor, 1998: 5). Transformative learning is based on critical reflection, dialogue, and experience (Mezirow, 1991).

OECD and UNESCO have been addressing the issue of lifelong learning for a long time, discussing education and qualifications. The transition from formal education to lifelong learning has led to a different interest in lifelong learning. This understanding of lifelong learning has opened up a new space for transformational learning.

It seems possible to say that TLT can improve our understanding of lifelong learning by emphasizing personality change and embedding the learning process in one's life. With regard to TLT, lifelong learning can be considered in more detail as the transformation of knowledge and the transformation of perspective. TLT offers a theoretical perspective for understanding lifelong learning, as it emphasizes the process of interpreting experiences. In this context, lifelong learning is not limited to the acquisition of new knowledge, but is seen as the process of reflecting and transforming previous knowledge and semantic schemas (Hof, 2017: 274).

Transformational Learning Process and Phases

The transformational learning process has its own characteristics. The first reason that pushes a person to transformational learning is a state of internal crisis. Mezirow (2009) defines this situation personally *a disorienting dilemma*. Disorienting dilemma is seen as the first phase that triggers transformational learning. From another point of view, the person evaluates the situation that his experiences no longer satisfy him or will not lead him to the goals he intended. This process is sometimes the moment when the individual is in a state of

anger or a feeling of guilt within himself. In fact, in this period, the person examines his experiences through internal criticisms, tries to reconsider and make sense of them. Mezirow (2009) describes this situation as the phase in which the transformation begins. The individual who exceeds this phase wants to acquire new roles and experiences for himself. This can only be achieved by acquiring a new action plan and, accordingly, new knowledge and skills. When the new situation is experienced and successful, new roles are tried to be acquired and the transformation is made sustainable. With the courage of these new experiences, a self-confidence development begins in the person and he/she integrates himself/herself into life with these new roles. Brock (2010) states that in transformational learning, one does not always have to start from the first step and step through each step in order. Because, thanks to what life brings, there is also the possibility that some steps have been overcome without the person being aware of it.

In the transformational learning process, the individual's access to new information

takes place at certain phases. These steps offer different perspectives to the individual in accessing new information. These steps of Mezirow (2000: 3-33) are given in Figure 1:



Figure 1. Mezirow's Transformational Learning Phases

Source: Mezirow, 2000: 3-33

The lack of studies on why adults enter a new learning process, what they experience during the transformation process, and the new roles and skills they acquire through transformational learning leads to the need to examine this issue in more depth. In the literature review

on transformational learning, it is understood that research is generally carried out outside of andragogy. The fact that transformational learning is also a reflective learning and reconstructing has led to the proliferation of pedagogical practices and the need to look at the learning problem from a "transformational" perspective. For this reason, the study to be carried out will eliminate an important literature deficiency.

Purpose of the Study

This study aims to show the extent to which the transformation occurs in adults, who are transformational learners, within the framework of transformational learning theory, with international examples.

Sub-Objectives

The main question of the study has been tried to be answered with the following questions:

1. What are the factors that cause transformational learning in adults?
2. How did the stages of transformational learning theory take place in the lives of adults?
3. What are transformational learning outcomes in adults?

Importance of Study

In the developing and changing world, people's learning needs are constantly changing. After graduating from formal education, people tend to learn both for the requirements of business life and to increase their motivation in their own lives. It is clear that education has an important place in every period of human life. Research on adult learning

continued, as did research and theories about learning during childhood and adolescence, and adult-specific theories emerged. One of these theories is TLT, which guides adult learning. This research is important in understanding transformational adult learning by education policymakers, adult education program professionals, and all adult learning institutions.

Finally, although the subject of Lifelong Learning is emphasized in our country, the lack of sufficient research revealing TLT and how this theory is realized in the learning process of adults shows the need to conduct research on this theory. Due to the lack of sufficient research, it is the result of not being able to benefit from the benefits of the theory, which realizes the provision of such effective and permanent learning and makes a great contribution to the creation of empathy. It seems necessary that the transformational learning theory should be accepted and applied by educators and administrators in the lifelong learning process, especially in adult learning institutions. It is expected that this research will facilitate the inclusion of transformational learning activities in the educational programs prepared for adult education institutions in the context of adult education. The transformation of the individual as a result of learning in life can lead to the transformation of the society in which the individual lives.

Study Model

In this study, phenomenological approach, which is one of the qualitative research methods, was used and the data were obtained through face-to-face interviews with the adults participating in the study, audio and video recordings. Phenomenology is a qualitative research method that enables people to express their understanding, feelings, perspectives, and perceptions about a particular phenomenon or concept, and is used to describe how they experience that phenomenon (Rose, Beeby, & Parker, 1995: 1124). In the phenomenological approach, the experiences of a phenomenon and the meanings reached in the light of these experiences are examined in depth (Patton, 2014).

Participants of the Study

In this qualitative study, participants were determined using the purposive sampling method. In accordance with the purpose, participants from different educational backgrounds and ages who took part in the Erasmus+ project named 'Transform Me: Developing Social Inclusion of Adults As Transformational Learners' were determined. The aim here is to create a relatively small sample and to reflect the diversity of individuals who may be parties to the problem studied in this sample to the maximum extent (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2018: 119). In phenomenological research, the participants in the sample selection should have experience in the context of the phenomenon that is the subject of the research (Creswell, 2018). Based on Mezirow's (2000) *Perspective Transformation*, research participants who had experience of transformation due to reasons such as chaos that deeply affected them in their lives were identified.

As a result of the information and sessions, it was determined that 8 adults who stated that they had transformed themselves had transformational learning experience. In this direction, the research was carried out with the participants whose demographic data are presented in Table 2.

For this study, the participants were given preliminary information about the TLT and the purpose of the research and were interviewed at least three times. As Moustakas (1994) stated, the participants in the research are those who have a lot of experience with the phenomenon, are interested in understanding the phenomenon, and are willing to take part in the research as participants.

The participants of the study consist of people who have undergone transformation at least once in their lives and have the demographic characteristics in the table below. The general characteristics of the participants in the study are as follows:

Table 2.
Demographic Data of Participants

CODE	COUNTRY	AGE	GENDER	OCCUPATION
ŞİRİN	TURKIYE	43	Female	Retired
DENİZ	TURKIYE	40	Female	Businesswoman
MELEK	TURKIYE	59	Female	Retired
TEJ	SLOVENIA	43	Female	Journalist
KAMILA	SLOVENIA	27	Female	Project Manager
ANGELA	SLOVENIA	40	Female	Entrepreneur
NINA	SLOVAKIA	30	Female	Project Manager
FABIANA	ITALY	31	Female	Entrepreneur

In order to protect the confidentiality of the research participants, the names that are different from their real names but the same as the initials of their real names are given in the table above. This is important for the researchers to be able to easily perceive and interpret who the participant is in his mind while analyzing the data obtained from the participants. When the participants started to be interviewed for the research, it was explained that different names would be used in the research so that they could easily express their opinions without hesitation. Although some participants stated that they did not hesitate to learn their identities, their identities were kept secret by the researchers. Thus, the confidentiality of the participants was protected and the understanding of ethics in the research was taken into account.

Data Collection

The data collection in the study was carried out through face-to-face interviews with a total of 8 participants, 3 from Turkey and Slovenia, 1 from Italy and 1 from the host- Slovakia, from the countries participating in each mobility, where the researchers in the four partner countries determined that they experienced transformational learning. According to Patton (2014: 341), "We interview people to find things that we cannot directly observe. We cannot observe feelings, thoughts, and intentions. We cannot observe situations in which there is no observer. We cannot observe how people organize their lives and what meanings they attribute to the events that take place in their lives. We have to ask people questions to find out about these things."

In order to collect data in the study, an interview form was developed by the researchers for adults with transformational learning experience. The interview form consisted of semi-structured questions.

Adult Interview Form with Transformational Learning Experience: Before preparing the interview form, the literature on TLT was examined. In order to develop a form consisting of semi-structured interview questions by the researchers, an academic expert opinion from the field of Curriculum and Instruction was obtained; In accordance with the general purpose and sub-objectives *of the research, what kind of life adults led before the transformation, what was the reason for the transformation, what was the transformation they experienced, what kind of dilemma they felt, The themes of whether they have prejudices about the event that caused the transformation, if any, what happened, how the emotions they experienced before the transformation, critical reflection, change of meaning schemes, the need for new roles and the formation stages of new roles, and how this transformation was reflected in adult lives were* determined. In the next step, the questions of the interview form were written. A total of 35 questions were written about the themes determined first. However, 7 of these questions were eliminated as they were thought to be similar and 8 of them would not contribute to the research. Thus, the number of questions has been reduced to 20. In some questions, sub-questions have been added to reach deeper, more descriptive data. In order for this interview form to be valid and reliable, the opinions of three academicians from the field of Educational Sciences, two from the adult education institution and one English language and literature teacher experts were consulted to check the appropriateness of the English spelling rules while preparing the interview questions. A preliminary trial was conducted on two

adults, and the interview questions were finalized as a result of the feedback from the expert opinions and the results of the preliminary trial.

Interviews were conducted with the participants at more than one time and logically connected to each other. Based on the fact that the researchers had to interact intensively with the interviewee or individuals in order to reveal and explain the experiences in depth, close relations were established with all of the participants before the interview and it was understood that trust in the researchers was established. Thus, it was ensured that quality data were obtained in data collection through interviews in the research. Interviews were held at the appropriate place, date and time as the primary opinion of the participant to meet with the participant. The interviews were recorded with audio and video. A total of 528 minutes of interviews were recorded with 8 participants. The shortest interview recording was 30 minutes and the longest interview was 62 minutes. As a result of transcribing the interview records, a total of 48 pages of written data were obtained.

Analysis of Data

The potential of qualitative data and the emergence of its content are closely related to its correct analysis (Miles and Huberman, 2016). In this study, the "descriptive analysis" technique, which is one of the qualitative data analysis techniques, was used in the analysis of the data obtained from the research, since it was aimed to reach the essence of the experience of the participants towards the phenomenon and to interpret their experiences. The data obtained from the research were analyzed according to the descriptive analysis technique as follows:

1. The data obtained through audio and video recording were translated into interview transcripts for each participant. These transcripts were read many times by the researchers and the audio recordings were listened to again when necessary for a quality data analysis. When there were incomprehensible places in the interview texts, the participants were interviewed again both face-to-face and by phone. Participant confirmation has been obtained.
2. The profiles of the adult participants participating in the research are given in Table 2.
3. The data obtained from the interview transcripts were read and organized under the themes determined according to the descriptive analysis technique in accordance with the first sub-objective of the research, "What are the factors that cause transformational learning of adults?". Then, the findings were described and interpreted.
4. Since this research was conducted in the context of TLT, the second sub-objective of the research, which is to discover how the TLT stages take place in the lives of adults, were determined as 10 phases of perspective transformation themes, and the data were read, organized, and the findings were described and interpreted under the themes created based on this.
5. The third objective of the research is to understand what are the transformational learning outcomes in adults. At this stage, the sub-objective of the research was determined as the theme of transformational learning outcomes of adults, the data were arranged under this theme and the findings were described and interpreted.

Validity and Reliability of Data

Licolen and Guba (1985) think that it is more appropriate for the nature of qualitative research to use concepts such as credibility, transferability, consistency and confirmability in qualitative research instead of validity and reliability statements as in quantitative research. In this direction, the following measures have been taken to increase the validity and reliability of the research;

1. In this study, long-term interaction was achieved by frequently interviewing the participants. Thus, it was ensured that the data were obtained convincingly in the research. In particular, care was taken to include adults of different ages, statuses and socio-economic backgrounds as participants. After the interviews were transcribed, participant confirmation was obtained. At this stage, the findings were summarized and presented to the participants, and a confirmation interview meeting was held.
2. In order to ensure the transferability of the research, the research process and what was done in this process were tried to be described in detail. In this context, the model of the research, the participants, the data collection tool, the data collection process, the analysis and interpretation of the data are defined in detail.
3. To increase the consistency of the research, the findings were supported by direct quotations from the opinions of the participants. In order to increase the reliability of the research, expert opinion was used in the preparation of the interview form consisting of semi-structured questions, checking the data transcribed on the computer, and determining the themes. Since an interview form consisting of interview questions was used in the data collection phase, it was ensured that the interviews with the participants were as compatible with each other as possible.
4. In order to ensure the confirmability of the research, the interview records and written texts were confirmed by comparing them with the results obtained in the research. On the other hand, documents and audio-video recordings related to the research were kept securely in order to be accessed again when deemed necessary.

FINDINGS AND INTERPRETATION

The answers given by the participants, whose opinions were taken in accordance with the research questions, were analyzed, the factors that caused the transformation of the participants were determined and the findings about how they passed the stages of the transformational learning process were analyzed. The transformational learning experiences and achievements of the participants were analyzed under separate headings.

1. Factors That Caused Transformational Learning of Adults

Under this heading, the reasons that push the participants to the transformational learning process were analyzed, and the findings were shared separately, supported by the participants' own self-explanations.

Şirin cites her father's death too early as the reason that pushed her to transform. Şirin states that she has very good memories with her father and that she longs for him. In addition, the loss of her father at an early age had a negative impact on her education life. She said that his life had taken a different shape from she had imagined: *"Unfortunately, everything had turned into a completely different situation."* she stated.

"Leaving my husband and moving to Izmir with my daughter. My transformation is to get divorced and move to another city."(DENİZ)

Deniz thinks that moving to Izmir with her daughter due to the separation from her husband is the reason for her transformation.

It is understood that many events caused Melek to enter the transformation process. First of all, the earthquake she experienced, the loss of her parents, the deterioration of their business due to the crisis and their bankruptcy, and as a result, her husband's heart attack deeply affected Melek and it is understood that it was the reason for her transformation. *"My parents were staying with us that night. The next day, my parents would leave and go home."* also shows that she feels guilty.

The reason that pushes Tej to transform is her mother's very controlling approach and her relationship with her: "*Because she was always in the bad mood and too much just controlling and not listening to me the way she should.*" is understood from her words.

According to Kamila, the reason for her transformation is that she had to cut short her student exchange and go back home due to the COVID-19 lockdown.

"I was divorced after 20 years of living with my ex husband, partner and a father... But on some way I recognized that I am not happy inside me to serve others, instead to serve a little to myself also and feel happiness, joy and fulfillment in ." (ANGELA)

Angela's divorce from her husband and her questioning of her own life can be seen as the initiator of her transformation.

"The Summer after my graduation and my master I entered a tunnel of deep darkness and despair. Somebody called it depression, somebody else burnout. Somebody just thought I had gone crazy." (FABIANA)

It is understood from her words that there were a series of events that caused Fabiana's transformation and that a psychologically difficult situation became inextricable. Transformation has become imperative.

"The transformation has been an ongoing process of fluid-like changes in the perception of all the events happening in life. The key has been set in embracing and accepting change and transformation as a positive aspect in self-development and self-perception." (NINA)

Nina's belief that she will be transformed by accepting her own development and change is evident from her words that she has caused her to transform.

2. Phases of Transformational Learning Theory

Under this heading, the experiences of the participating adults in the stages of the transformational learning process are given separately.

1. A Disorienting Dilemma

It is the first stage of transformational learning. The person is faced with a problem that creates internal confusion and dilemma. He/She cannot solve this problematic situation with the problem-solving strategies he/she had before.

"He was very young (37) when he died in a car accident. It was devastating for me. I thought I would have a different life before." (SIRIN).

While describing the dilemma she was in before her transformation, Şirin pointed out that she could not accept the situation. She thought that this devastating event was a disaster for her and that nothing would be the same again. Şirin, who was influenced by the circumstances at an early age, struggled hard and was able to get rid of dilemmas.

"I had given up on myself, I started to become an unhappy, negative, low-energy person. I was very critical of myself for why I shut myself down. How can I take responsibility for a child on my own? When I returned to my family in Izmir, I thought a lot about whether I could live with them. My goal in life is to be happy, and I think if I'm happy, I can figure it all out." (DENİZ).

Deniz has had negative feelings psychologically due to the divorce and moving she has experienced. On the other hand, she was hesitant to live with his family. This shows that she is in a dilemma.

"Not only because of the earthquake, but also because of the economic crisis in the country after the earthquake, my husband's business did not go well, he went bankrupt and had to sell his business. We lost everything. We started working on other jobs. The economic hardship we experienced caused my husband to have a heart attack. Our life was very good, after what we went through, our life started to get difficult... We had a more comfortable

life financially. I was very friendly. I knew everyone as myself. I was very giving. I realized that the people I knew were my friends weren't actually my friends" (MELEK).

Melek said that both the earthquake and the fact that their business did not go well and they had economic difficulties; On the other hand, the fact that the circle of friends she trusted moved away from them caused her to fall into a dilemma.

"I always said, that she wanted that I would be closed just in one box, she was cutting my wings, my wishes, my ideas for progress and different life that she was having. That transformation was really a must, otherwise we both could go down and our relationship would be even worse. Also people notice that I was nervous, when she was around or when she was calling me. Because she was always in the bad mood and too much just controlling and not listening to me the way she should. Even for example, if I couldn't answer on the phone and I call her back after 10 minutes, she was out of her mind. She always said, that she is in a worry and that she thinks that something bad happened to me." (TEJ).

Tej's discomfort with her mother being too controlling caused her to noticeably have bad feelings and behaviors. Again, she came to the conclusion that she could cope with this situation herself and questioned herself for solutions.

"I was a very introverted person, very self – critical and self – aware. I found comfort in routine and the known. I had troubles finding individuals who resonated with me... I struggled emotionally with leaving my family and with doubting my capabilities." (KAMILA).

It turns out that Kamila was previously self-critical about having an introverted character. She also had doubts about self-actualization, what she wanted to do and what she could do.

"But in some way I recognized that I am not happy inside me to serve others. And at some point my inner voice started to be more loud day by day, when I realized I was living in an environment that doesn't support my ability to live my purpose." (ANGELA).

From these views of Angela, it is understood that she is not satisfied with her life and thinks about this dissatisfaction.

"The dilemma of being perceived the way I expected was to put myself through the situations I was fearing. Going into a respectful confrontation with a family member or a friend where I felt an injustice, asking for a meeting with a business leader when I felt like I needed help or support, or simply deserved a higher salary. Approached new people when I wanted to be included." (NINA).

It is understood that Nina's fear of how she will be perceived by others during the transformation phase puts her in a dilemma and affects what she will do.

"In the beginning, transformation wasn't easy for me. I was scared, felt guilty and lost. I didn't believe I was able to change, and to adapt to a new life plan. As time passed by, I started approaching the process with curiosity and enjoying the experience." (FABIANA)

Fabiana stated that she had experienced a dilemma about transformation and had hesitations about adapting to the new life, but she overcame it with the pleasure of the experience: "*as time passed by, I started approaching the process with curiosity and enjoying the experience.*" She stated in his words.

2. A self-examination with feelings of guilt or shame.

It is the second phase of transformational learning. The person produces self-esteem by experiencing emotions such as fear, anger, and guilt about a problem that poses a dilemma for him/her. Sometimes he/she turns to religion for support.

"I questioned myself a lot about why I did not continue my education at the same time as I took care of our family life. This has been something that has stayed with me." (ŞİRİN).

Şirin criticized what she wanted to do without entering the transformation process with a self-critical view of the right or wrong step she took. It remains a regret that she interrupted his education.

"I questioned, there was no such thing as divorce in my family and I did not tell my parents that I was going to get a divorce until the last moment. I wondered if I was doing it wrong, if my parents would blame me. But at the end of the day, I came to life once and I had to do the right thing for myself." (DENİZ).

It is understood that she logically questions the choices she makes in the transformational learning process depending on the awareness of Deniz. While doing this questioning, she also questions what the people around her thought. Although she also cares about the opinion of others, she has realized that her own opinion is important.

"I questioned the authenticity of the relationships and friendships I had made. When there is a big and devastating event in a person's life, good day and bad day friends around her/him appear." (MELEK).

In these statements, Melek criticizes her relationships with the people around her. While questioning the relationships she had experienced, she also directed herself to self-criticism.

"I was questioning if moving abroad and leaving my family was selfish of me. Today I realize I made the best decision for all of us, and I'm continuing to make them proud using the foundations they raised me on." (KAMILA).

Although Kamila is self-critical, she is aware that the transformation she has experienced is true.

"In the beginning I felt both, guilt and shame. I dealt with shame but there still comes some moment, when I feel a little bit of guilt, but in the second moment I tell myself that everything is in alignment to be as it is for the best of all of us." (ANGELA).

Although Angela initially felt guilt and shame, she was able to overcome it.

"Absolutely. Those feelings are an inevitable part of every transformation questioning if you have a right to differ with your opinion from your parents/grandparents and other figures. Having a hard time ending relationships with friends, ex-lovers or former co-workers. Where exactly will I draw the line of the "enough is enough"? (NINA).

Nina is conflicted about thinking differently from the people around her, and she feels guilty about setting boundaries in their relationships.

"In the beginning, transformation wasn't easy for me. I was scared, felt guilty and lost. I didn't believe I was able to change, and to adapt to a new life plan"? (FABIANA).

Fabiana stated that she was in a state of guilt and fear about the dilemma she experienced and the transformation that followed.

3. A critical assessment of epistemic, sociocultural, or psychic assumptions.

It is the third phase of transformational learning. The individual evaluates their assumptions and feelings about the dilemma they are experiencing.

"At first, I was always ignoring my own wishes. My priority was always my loved ones, and if I had my mind now, I would make an effort for my own life." (ŞİRİN).

Şirin made these criticisms towards her own psychological assumptions and drew attention to the damages she suffered from the prevailing assumptions. Şirin emphasized that in order to prevent these problems from happening again, in other words, in order for the transformation to take place, these assumptions should be gotten rid of or changed.

"Before my transformation, I always had wonders. I was in a lot of dilemmas such as whether I could do it or what kind of reactions I would get from the environment, but now I am more confident in myself. I believe I can achieve anything. If I hadn't changed myself, I would have been a bad mother, because I would have lost more and more self-confidence." (DENİZ).

By making a critique of socio-cultural assumptions, Deniz tries to clarify the dilemma she is experiencing, or rather, to clarify the possible problems that may occur for this reason. The criticism has been in favor of changing the prevailing assumptions.

"Before, I didn't think much about the future. I was just having fun. I thought everything would go well, the same. It was one thing for my parents to die. Then I felt like I was all alone. We were five siblings, we used to hug each other. After the loss of my parents, the siblings stopped communicating with each other; I understood that mom and dad kept siblings together.." (MELEK).

Melek made these criticisms against her own psychological assumptions and drew attention to the damages she suffered from the prevailing assumptions.

"Because you have so much worries, you have demons in your head and you are not sleeping good and that's why you are not ok. All the time you are nervous and that stuff. You are in a circle of bad patterns." (TEJ).

Tej makes all its criticisms on epistemological assumptions. Psychologically, he draws attention to the effects of having bad thoughts on him.

"Before, I thought that life followed a preset path and because of this I was very critical of others who didn't follow the path I thought is right. This is also where my own self criticism has roots. However, my outlook on life has changed drastically. Today I'm thankful for the life I have, I realize that each person has their own unique journey, with challenges and successes. I'd like to attribute my perspective shift to my experiences in international learning and working with people from different backgrounds." (KAMILA).

Kamila critiqued socio-cultural assumptions and then made a psychological assessment. Her socio-cultural critique later reached a self-critical conclusion. As a result, she made her own way and was satisfied with his situation. This can lead to the conclusion that the transformation has been successful.

"I believed in the system, in what they teach us in school. In the fact that we are here to serve the system, the family, the job, the environment, that we take into account the habits and customs and follow them because it is right. But then I realized that life is much more than what is outside of us in physical form. That people are energy that we emit, so that we attract. That we create our situation with what we think, with what we feel, and in fact there are no limits - if we step into the heart, we love, we take care of ourselves to the best possible extent, and we are in the here and now. And so I began to discover my depth, began to meet new people who vibrate the same, who co-create a more beautiful and better environment in which I feel motivated, inspired and loved." (ANGELA).

Angela made a self-assessment by criticizing socio-cultural assumptions and looking for a way out.

"My particular issue of being always perceived as different has deepened as I could not relate to my peers in many aspects. However, I accepted that everybody might be going through something difficult in their own lives." (NINA).

Nina made a self-assessment by criticizing psychological assumptions and found a way out with her acceptance that everyone has difficulties in their lives.

"The Summer after my graduation and my master I entered a tunnel of deep darkness and despair. Somebody called it depression, somebody else burnout. Somebody just thought I had gone crazy. I couldn't sleep, I couldn't eat. I didn't want to go out, because I was scared to leave my house. I barely could talk. I couldn't do anything. My mind was in a spiral of negative thinking. It went on like this for almost two months. It was a nightmare: I believed

I was experiencing some kind of "death". Until one day I decided that I needed to take action. Do something to survive." (FABIANA).

While Fabiana explained her dilemma by making psychological assumptions, she looked for a way out by evaluating what she felt before she was transformed.

4. Recognition that one's discontent and the process of transformation are shared and that others have negotiated a similar change.

It is the fourth phase of transformational learning. The individual becomes aware of the dissatisfaction he experiences and shares his/her thoughts about this problem with the people around him or with those who have the same experience.

"At first, I was always ignoring my own wishes. My priority was always my loved ones, and if I had my mind now, I would make an effort for my own life. ... I had to learn by experiencing life for myself. I didn't get ideas or support from anyone." (ŞİRİN).

Şirin criticized her personality and psychological structure before the transformation and stated that she was not happy with it. Thinking of others rather than herself, she realized that she was not satisfied with this and that her priority was to value herself. She stated that she got rid of her own experiences without benefiting from the ideas or experiences of others.

"If you look at me, according to the people around me, the reason for my divorce is not a real reason. No one knows what it is when you don't live in it. Others have certainly experienced it, and there are those who have thought about these dilemmas and given up. That sounds like courage to me." (DENİZ).

This statement stated that Deniz's courage in the experiences of others encouraged her, and that it could not be understood without going into the details of what she shared with others, so everyone's experience was different and they fell into a dilemma.

"People used to be our friends, so I started to think why they didn't come to us anymore. I trusted people too much, I realized that I shouldn't trust them so much. I realized that not everyone is the same. I didn't think any harm would come from anyone. That's how I used to look at life. We were living in an old building with my daughter, who had the same things as me, we decided to move to a new building, we decided to move to Güzelbahçe together because it was a quieter place, I am glad that we made such a decision, now I am very happy." (MELEK).

Melek expressed her discomfort with the contradictions and dilemmas she experienced during the transformation process. She states that she feels uneasy because she trusts people too much, and she tries to overcome this problem by accepting it. She thought that her daughter, like her, had the same experience, and that she had decided to live where she was happy now, trusting her, and that this decision was the right one.

"Also people notice that I was nervous, when she was around or when she was calling me. Because she was always in the bad mood and too much just controlling and not listening to me the way she should. Even for example, if I couldn't answer on the phone and I call her back after 10 minutes, she was out of her mind. She always said, that she is in a worry and that she thinks that something bad happened to me." (TEJ).

It is understood that Tej has a serious degree of discontent with her mother in her relationship with her mother. She is aware that the people around her are also aware of this situation. However, Tej explains that she decided to make an effort to mend her relationship with her mother. *'I wanted to rescue me and also her and our relationship, which I wanted to be better and that we will have both better mentally health.'*

"I turned for advice and guidance to students and colleagues who were undergoing similar experiences, and their advice proved to be invaluable. They offered different perspectives on how to overcome challenges and make the most out of opportunities.

The awareness that others are going through similar dilemmas has been a significant factor in shaping my mindset. Realizing that everyone encounters challenges at some point has been a transformative realization.

In discussion with fellow international learners, it became apparent that the dilemmas we face, whether linguistic, cultural, academic or emotional are interconnected.” (KAMILA).

It is understood from the words that Kamila has shared her dilemma and discontent with other people who have experienced a similar situation, and that the experience and sharing of experience she has received from them offers Kamila a different perspective.

“In some ways I have. But I have never compared myself or my relationship with other’s, because each one of us is unique, has it’s own issues and I was seeing straight what a relationship I wanna build with my ex for the best of our daughter. Although, we will always be family and connected just a little bit diferent. Today I am proud of my ex and myself to be able to have such relationship which give’s our daughter best she needs.” (ANGELA).

In her statement, which also included Angela's meetings or meetings with other people who went through similar processes related to transformation, she emphasized that the pain experienced causes different effects on different people. However, it is understood that she will continue to meet with her ex-husband for the benefit of her daughter, so she has found a solution for herself.

“Only later on in life and also mostly online have I found people who were speaking of very similar aspects of life as I have been experiencing. Only then I found people who might not follow the traditional routes in life biased spiritually, culturally, based on religious or social beliefs and predispositions.” (NINA).

Nina compared her own experiences with those of others about her transformation and came to the conclusion that the dilemma could not be solved by traditional means.

5. Exploration of options for new roles, relationships, and actions.

It is the fifth phase of transformational learning. The person explores and evaluates options for new roles, relationships, and activities.

“I couldn't be like my friends anymore. I had a family to support. I was now in the role of mother, father and sister at home. Thus, I became a mature person without being able to live my youth. Of course, it was not easy for me to start working life early. At first, I had a hard time with the naivety of my age. I had a shy, timid nature. When someone said something, I would blush, I would hardly answer. Over time, I overcame them, of course, they were all part of the transformation.” (ŞİRİN).

It is understood that due to losing her cute father at an early age, she will no longer be like her friends, she will not have a life like them, she had to work at an early age, and this affected her deeply. It can be understood that she used to describe herself as shy and that she overcame it over time as part of the transformation.

“After I came to Izmir, I started to get involved in life again. Within a month, I applied to public education. I started the tile course and continued for 2 years. I met a lot of people and spent almost all my time on this endeavor. It was like I didn't go to a psychologist, I went to courses. I thought a lot about whether I would fall into the void. I said that if I relaxed myself, I wouldn't need anything, and I continued with the courses. After the tile course, I went to the sculpture course. I attended many courses such as folk dances and 'Bendir’.” (DENİZ).

It is seen that Deniz often tries to transform and often experiences new roles in order to get rid of the situation she is in and lead a life as she wants. In order to be transformed, she was able to "lead a free life and stand on her own feet, and she was psychologically relieved with the help of adult education programs. It is understood that attending the courses helped Deniz to meet different people and this helped her socialize.

"I started attending courses at the Public Education Center. After my husband's illness progressed, we dealt with his treatments. I'm having a lot of difficulty inside the house. I started courses with the advice of my daughter." (MELEK).

On the one hand, Melek started courses with the advice of her daughter to try to get rid of her discontent for her own transformation, and on the other hand, she makes efforts for her husband's recovery. She is also happy to consider the option offered for her own transformation.

"When I started to do things differently, I said: »Ok mum, I will do things as you want, everything will be ok. And She was surprised. I tried to put that different behavior also at my voice and my actions. These two important things. So all circle it has to be ready for practicing: mind, voice, behavior and actions. " (TEJ).

Tej got rid of her bad thoughts with the belief that she would lead a more meaningful and effective life with the new roles she acquired in her transformation, and generally took on the role of being a leader in her relationship with her mother. It can be said that Tej is in search of the transformation process. It can be understood that this is to improve their own behavior, thoughts and actions.

"My student exchange in Portugal marked a transformative period. This led me to actively seek new opportunities and roles that aligned with my aspirations. In my search for personal and professional growth, I explored potential work opportunities abroad as a student. This led me to do Erasmus practice in Slovenia, an experience that solidified my desire to move abroad. Following my Erasmus practice, I became determined about moving abroad and pursuing a career in a global setting. Since then, I have consistently sought out new roles and opportunities that resonate with my commitment to expanding my global perspective and embracing diverse experiences." (KAMILA).

During the transformation process, Kamila explored new opportunities for both her business and personal development and finalized her decisions as actions. On the other hand, she has also gone through a mental process of her options regarding her actions.

"I started to become a better version of my self in every aspect, I tried things I have never did, I enjoyed each moment and opportunity given to me and felt good. The most difficult for me was accepting that I don't fit into those relationships I started to question if people actually were living their own story or the story of someone else and I realized that each one of us create's their own program." (ANGELA).

Angela researched and experimented with new roles, relationships, and actions, while questioning herself in relationships and experiencing enlightenment, understanding that everyone's own story is special. She revealed that she understood her inner potential by listening to her inner voice with the following words: *"I am living my story, by listen to my inner voice, to experience how to think diferent, how to do diferent and how to achive the unimaginaire things and situations in my life."*

"I tried to search for new ways, new experiences and a new igniting environment. That involved a change of my job, making some new friends, travelling to new destinations and exchanging stories with people of different backgrounds." (NINA).

It is understood that Nina has experienced new experiences and surroundings thanks to the transformation, and has made new discoveries in her life.

"As time passed by, I started approaching the process with curiosity and enjoying the experience." (FABIANA).

It is understood that Fabiana is letting herself go with the flow of experience rather than exploring options for new roles.

6. Planning of a course of action.

It is the sixth phase of transformational learning. The person creates a roadmap for the options they find as a result of their sharing.

"Nowadays, I try to take advantage of every opportunity I find to do something for myself. For example, I try to learn the things I always wanted to learn." (ŞİRİN).

Şirin, who had to work at an early age and thought that she could not live her youth as a result, made her life more active by taking time for herself, doing something for herself, and learning new things at every opportunity.

"I do a lot of things, I have sculptures, I have tile plates. I make jewelry from tiles. Within a month, I applied to public education. I started the tile course and continued for 2 years. I met a lot of people and spent almost all my time on this endeavor. It was like I didn't go to a psychologist, I went to courses. I thought a lot about whether I would fall into the void." (DENİZ).

The fact that she applied and attended courses at the public education center in order to improve her own knowledge and skills shows that Deniz carried out the transformation in a planned manner.

"I started sports courses, I started folk dances and I improved myself in those courses. I started with Bendir. I always wanted to play a musical instrument." (MELEK).

It is understood that Melek has made a plan to start courses to overcome the problems she is experiencing. On the other hand, she stated that her plan for the future is to play a musical instrument and expressed part of the plan of transformation.

"There were different days, but because our relationship didn't work for many years, it was pattern that was not ok, I decided so much to be successful and patient. Success was in my mind. And this is very important. I knew that I will pass all those bad days and exams of the life, exams of the relationship. I was very passionate and calm and had very strong decision. I really had peace in my mind." (TEJ).

Instead of ignoring the problem she was experiencing, Tej decided to prepare an action plan for the transformation. She has made plans to implement this decision and put them into practice.

"This led me to do Erasmus practice in Slovenia, an experience that solidified my desire to move abroad. Following my Erasmus practice, I became determined about moving abroad and pursuing a career in a global setting. Since then, I have consistently sought out new roles and opportunities that resonate with my commitment to expanding my global perspective and embracing diverse experiences." (KAMILA).

It is understood that Kamila has planned exactly how to carry out her actions step by step, drawing on her own experience in her transformation.

"I found an opportunity to educate myself to be able to be independent, to have a skillset to give myself financial freedom, and to be able to achieve my goals. I found out that I have a good leadership inside me, so I shared my knowledge my skills to other people like they did to me 2 year's ago. In winter I started to teach kids skiing again, and found out that it fill's my soul." (ANGELA).

From Angela's statements, it is understood that she has made plans to develop herself with her transformation. Along with the experience she has experienced, she has also discovered his own strengths by thinking critically.

"My plan was to purposely put myself through situations that caused me anxiety, discomfort and sort of cringing as I had a tendency to shut off directly or to escape a whole situation instead of facing it. The influence stemmed from the observation that I viewed people who were able to stand up for themselves in a nice, respectful manner as very inspiring and exactly what I wanted to reach. Not doubting myself and having healthy self-confidence." (NINA).

Nina described her dilemma and considered her options for planning action. By observing other people, she understood how they got out of the disgruntled situation and concluded that she could get out of the dilemma in this way.

"I started my freelancing business, which is doing well. I work with creativity, and writing, which I've been passionate about since I was a child. I learnt how to take care of myself, recognize my feelings, my desires, and listen to my body. Now I can also do things that scare me: for example, learning to swim or taking a flight." (FABIANA).

Fabiana has resolutely planned her actions related to transformation. Because she knows herself, she is aware of what she can or cannot do.

7. Acquisition of knowledge and skills for implementing one's plans

It is the seventh phase of transformational learning. The person develops the knowledge and skills to bring their plans to life.

"I believe that the challenges I have experienced in my life have improved and strengthened me. I got a good network. And my human relations have improved positively." (ŞİRİN).

It is understood from Şirin's past experiences that she has gained knowledge and skills as a result of the struggles she has experienced, and that she has established a good network and improved human relations thanks to the experiences she has gained.

"... Within a month, I applied to public education. I started the tile course and continued for 2 years. I met a lot of people and spent almost all my time on this endeavor." (DENİZ).

Deniz has gained the knowledge and skills to implement transformation plans and still continues her transformation by benefiting from lifelong learning programs.

"I started sports courses, I started folk dances and I improved myself in those courses. I started with Bendir. I always wanted to play a musical instrument." (MELEK).

In this process, Melek improved herself by meeting different people by participating in various courses. She chose to improve her knowledge and skills in order to feel more comfortable socially and to experience transformation.

"I read a lot of books about different personality and psychology also about different mindsets and how it works also neurolinguistics programming. I watched also many videos from psychotherapists and how to deal with anxious people. Also I tried to listen myself, not just being with things that are written in books and were just words from psychotherapists and psychologists." (TEJ).

It is clearly understood that Tej developed her own knowledge and skills to put her plans into practice. As a necessary preparation for this, she read a lot of books and watched different programs and prepared herself psychologically.

"Knowledge, Skill Development, Language proficiency, Cultural competence, Adaptability and resilience, Networking and relationship building, Problem – solving and critical thinking." (KAMILA)

Kamila stated that she has taken steps to improve her knowledge and skills to implement the transformation plans.

"I was guided by the beliefs that everything that happens in my life is right, meant for me to grow through experiences, to become a better version of myself, to consciously change my beliefs, to let go of thoughts, patterns and beliefs that no longer serve my purpose. I defined my goals, what I want and what kind of person I want to become. I realize that if I want different results, I have to act differently, think differently and speak differently. And that's something I work on every day to become a better version of myself." (ANGELA).

In order to implement her transformation plans, Angela first got rid of thoughts and beliefs that were not beneficial to her, that prevented herself. She tried to improve her knowledge and skills by making a comprehensive plan.

“The skills of speaking out, facing rejection on a regular basis, mental exercise of understanding healthy boundaries in all sorts of professional and personal matters. Being proactive and taking the lead.”(NINA).

In general, Nina has gained skills in understanding professional and personal boundaries and doing mental exercises.

“During this process I did a lot of reading, studying and training both for personal and professional skills. I learnt a lot about myself and the environment I grew up in. Thanks to yoga and meditation, I developed more self awareness. As for work, I studied and experienced how to run a business, deal with clients, create a network, manage bureaucracy and finances, promote myself, and keep my vision even in challenging times and with “difficult” clients..”(FABIANA).

Fabiana has put in place plans to acquire the necessary knowledge, skills and abilities in the transformation process. Since she believes in the necessity of personal and professional development, she has worked on these issues.

8. Provisional trying of new roles

It is the eighth phase of transformational learning. It is the stage in which the person temporarily tries on newly acquired roles.

Şirin states that she did not experience serious difficulties in the process while trying her new roles, she was not subjected to environmental pressure, but some sacrifices had to be made for the family in Turkish society.

“I like to be productive, if I'm not productive, I'm not happy. It feels like if you don't produce, you'll be an empty person. I go to work, I get off work, I go to folk dances in the evening, I sacrifice a lot of things. But I make time for my courses. These activities are good for me, when I am idle, I will constantly set up other things in my head. I have a daughter that I am raising, I want her to be productive.” (DENİZ).

In the transformation process, Deniz emphasizes the most about learning by trying the knowledge and skills she has gained and feeling productive. These feelings are a positive development for her and she expects her daughter, who is closest to her, to be productive and hardworking based on her own experiences.

“My daughter settled here. We came here not to leave my daughter alone because my daughter gave birth prematurely. I realized that this was the place for me. I'm very happy here” (MELEK).

While explaining how she feels while experiencing her new roles, Melek states that she is more peaceful and does not worry too much. She states that she has experienced that these roles have turned into a new and peaceful way of life in her.

“Sometimes was very hard and when I was just worried I always called her and said, please sit down and listen to me, we need to talk and also I reached new knowledge from different books or videos, which were given from psychotherapists.” (TEJ).

It is understood that Tej sometimes gets troubled in the roles she experiences with the transformation. But without giving up, she tried to learn new knowledge and skills to solve the situation she faced. Tej also received help from a psychotherapist as she experimented with her new roles.

“While living in an international environment, I've embraced a mindset that values adaptability and open-mindedness. This has led me to explore alternative approaches and solutions that may not align with conventional beliefs.” (KAMILA)

After experiencing her new role with an open mind, Kamila became open to different approaches and solutions, regardless of whether these approaches and solutions were actually compatible with traditional beliefs.

"I felt good in my new roles. I realized that I am the guardian of my well-being and no one else. The feeling of creating your own reality and your future without the influence of anyone outside of you is extraordinary. I felt great, full of energy, love and focus on what I want to attract into my life." (ANGELA).

Angela stated that she felt good and added positive things to her life after experiencing each new role she adopted from the moment she thought she needed to transform.

"I have embarked on more confident roles while speaking to others, negotiating conditions, expressing my expectations and needs." (NINA).

Nina is more confident in her ability to try out new roles, expressing needs and expectations.

9. Building of competence and self-confidence in new roles and relationships

It is the ninth phase of transformational learning. At this stage, the person is now competent and confident in their new role and relationships.

"Thanks to the mature character I have become, I think that I am someone whose word is highly valued in my environment. My opinions are always important." (ŞİRİN).

Şirin gained a different perspective with the new roles she adopted, and gained self-confidence as she achieved positive transformations. The fact that the experiences she gained with the effect of her personality and life before the transformation and her newly acquired roles left positive traces on her shows that she is also satisfied with the transformation.

"I am more comfortable in my relationships with those around me, I say what comes to mind. I don't say things just because people get upset. The reason for this may also be related to aging. I don't associate with people who can't handle it. I'm very adaptable." (DENİZ).

Every step Deniz took for the transformation she experienced made her experience new roles and every experience turned into self-confidence. The self-confidence she gained also gave her comfort in her relationship with people.

"My self-confidence has improved. I believe that I am a good mother, wife, grandmother and grandmother." (MELEK).

Melek states that she is self-critical and has the confidence to experience it again.

"Everything was in my hand, I can see that just now, when most job is done. If I wouldn't have decided for that, different relationship and for that transformation, there will not be any changes. Now I can see it has to be done like in the school: you need to learn first and then you have to do your exams and also put knowledge in the practical world." (TEJ).

Tej understood that the decisions she made and the actions she took during the transformation process were successful, and this created self-confidence in her. With this new perspective, those around her also gave a message.

"Whether it's in communication styles, problem-solving methods, or understanding societal norms, I've learned to appreciate the richness that comes from moving away from the familiar." (TEJ).

Kamila experienced an enlightenment and developed self-confidence by talking about the richness of learning to understand problem-solving methods, communication styles, and social norms by going beyond the ordinary. It is understood that Kamila is competent in her relationships thanks to the transformation.

"My new roles built confidence in me although it's hard sometimes... at the beginning I had trouble with my confidence, because I end my relationship and I felt guilty a lot. But then I realize that I am free, I can open to new relationships... still am single because I know that I have to be completely satisfied with myself, with my life to be able to get what I want. And I am focused on what I want, not on what I don't want." (ANGELA).

After Angela separated from her husband, she had difficulties and felt guilty for a while, but it is understood that she recovered from these feelings and thoughts and held on to life with a new perspective. She has realized that her own wishes are the priority.

"Mostly for my own self reflection to see how far I got and how much have I changed. The more brave decisions I have made in my personal life, I have seen the impact in my professional life as well and vice versa." (NINA).

It is thought that the new roles that Nina has acquired with the transformation have led to the possible development of self-confidence that has been appreciated by the society. It is understood that this situation caused Nina to embrace her roles thoroughly and increase her activities.

"Before my transformation, I used to think I never was good enough and I didn't deserve good things in my life. Now, when a challenge comes up, I think I have skills and power to face it. Sometimes negative thinking and "inner ghosts" still get in the middle, but the way I respond to it is different because I know and I feel I can do it." (FABIANA).

It is understood that Fabiana's transformation through enlightenment was successfully carried out and that she was self-critical about her past and compared her current roles.

10. A reintegration into one's life on the basis of conditions dictated by one's perspective

It is the final phase of transformational learning. At this stage, the person now develops re-adaptation to life with the completion of the transformation.

"Of course, my family problems continue, but I am now intervening from a distance. I try to put all my energy into my house, my husband, my daughters, and myself." (ŞİRİN).

It is understood that Şirin has adapted to life normally with the new perspective she adopted after her transformation.

"Psychologically, I experience a great deal of freedom. I'm very happy, I get the same feedback from everyone. I had a lot of self-confidence, but there were breaking points. I wondered if I couldn't do it. Right now, when I want to do something, I do it and I succeed. I don't think there's anything a happy person can't do. If you are happy, you do the best in every job." (DENİZ).

Deniz has embraced the transformation she has experienced, subjected the process she has gone through to self-criticism with this new perspective, and stated that the decisions she has taken are quite appropriate. Describing the gains she has achieved with the transformation as a great success, Deniz emphasized that there is nothing that cannot be done when she wants otherwise.

"Well, quite a bit. My self-confidence has improved. I can drive. I'm very happy here." (MELEK).

Melek thinks that she is happy with the gains she has made and that it has given her a good experience. She stated that she now evaluates life from a different perspective and that she still wants to make changes, especially for herself, with the following words: "*I still want to change things. I'm still not what I want it to be. I still want to change the way I look at the world. I want something for myself. I've always lived for others. I'm trying to learn.*" This attitude shows that Melek made her new perspective dominant for the rest of her life.

"I am using that form of transformation now about one year and a half and I really can say it is working. The main transformation was done, but I am still learning how to be even better. Results are still happening." (TEJ).

Tej is aware that the transformation she has experienced has been very positive. She states that she has experienced a great enlightenment with the transformation she has undergone. Tej, who thinks that she has evaluated life better with the new perspective she has gained in this way, admits that the real transformation is complete, but there is more to learn. Thanks to the transformation she experienced, she also gained the ability to approach events

from different perspectives, "If my mum is nervous, if she needs help with something I am helping her. I can also say, I am one step before her and I know how to help her with pensioned voice, hugs and passionate behavior." is understood from her words.

"I feel incredibly fortunate to have undergone the transformation due to the opportunity to study and abroad. Each of my experiences holds immense value for me, and I don't take any of them for granted." (KAMILA).

It is understood that Kamila's transformation, which started with studying and working abroad, caused her to acquire a new personality and perspective, and every experience she had was valuable to her. Kamila has become more conscious of life.

"I know that I have to be completely satisfied with myself, with my life to be able to get what I want. And I am focused on what I want, not on what I don't want." (ANGELA).

Angela's experience of transformation is to have a more positive outlook on life and it is understood that she is at peace with herself. Thanks to the experiences she has gained, she is of the opinion that she is more conscious by prioritizing her wishes for her transformation.

"I would like to embrace change and the fear of the unknown in my life that any sort of life transformation brings along. I feel more confident and aware of who I really am." (NINA).

It is understood from Nina's words that she has gained self-confidence about the transformation she has experienced and that new transformations are open in her life.

"Transformation was both the most scary and exciting process of my life. Since then, I'm aware that transforming is part of daily life because we are continuously changing to adapt to new situations. The most valuable outcome from this process is to know that change is good. And by letting go of control, beliefs and thinking patterns there is always something worth to experience on the other end of the tunnel." (FABIANA).

Fabiana sees transformation as a part of life. She believes that when we encounter new situations, we should adapt to it. She argues that transformation is good.

3. Transformational Learning Outcomes of Adults

Many of those who go through transformational learning gain new knowledge, skills, and attitudes through new experiences, dialogue with others who have had the same experience, and new frames of reference. Under this heading, the opinions of the participants were analyzed and the new achievements of the participants, which could be answered to the last question of the research, were shared.

"At first, I was always ignoring my own wishes. My priority was always my loved ones, and if I had my mind now, I would make an effort for my own life. Nowadays, I try to take advantage of every opportunity I find to do something for myself. For example, I try to learn the things I always wanted to learn." (ŞİRİN).

Outcome – cognitive : frame of reference (a new perspective): "The past is in the past, the important thing is to live in the moment to the fullest."; "The important thing in life is health." Şirin uses the free time gained by retiring at an early age by learning new things.

"I believe that the challenges I have experienced in my life have improved and strengthened me. I got a good network. And my human relations have improved positively. Thanks to the mature character I have become, I think that I am someone whose word is highly valued in my environment. My opinions are always important." (ŞİRİN).

Outcome – cognitive :frame of reference (a new perspective): "Development of human relations, self-worth"

"I was transformed in a positive way. My self-confidence has increased. I thought a lot about whether I could do it. How do I take responsibility for a child on my own? When I came back to my family in Izmir, I thought a lot about whether I could live with them. My goal in life is to be happy, and if I am happy, I think I can solve everything." (DENİZ).

Outcome - cognitive: "Self-confidence development"

"I started to get involved in life again. Within a month, I applied to public education. I started the tile course and continued for 2 years. I met a lot of people and spent almost all my time on this endeavor. It was like I didn't go to a psychologist, I went to courses. I thought a lot about whether I would fall into the void. I said that if I relaxed myself, I wouldn't need anything, and I continued with the courses. After the tile course, I went to the sculpture course. I attended many courses such as folk dances and 'Bendir. I am more comfortable in my relationships with those around me, I say what comes to mind. I don't say things just because people get upset. The reason for this may also be related to aging. I don't associate with people who can't handle it. I'm very adaptable."(DENİZ).

Outcome - affective: "Self-development, Social environment development"

"I understood the value of time. I try to live by thinking that today we are there and tomorrow we are gone. I think the time we spend with our loved ones is more valuable than anything else." (MELEK).

Outcome: "Cognitive enlightenment"

In these two views expressed by Melek, it is understood that she experienced a cognitive enlightenment and realized the value of time and the time spent with loved ones is the most valuable time.

"Before, we had a life that everyone could envy. We had a more comfortable life financially. I was very friendly. I knew everyone as myself. I was very giving. I realized that the people I knew to be my friends weren't actually my friends. There were very few people who could listen to me, people who would share with me. My self-confidence has improved. I can drive. I'm very happy here." (MELEK).

Outcome: "Cognitive enlightenment - Self-confidence development"

"That really change my life. I am more passionate also with other people – my friends, at the job and in my personal life. I am using that form of transformation now about one year and a half and I really can say it is working. The main transformation was done, but I am still learning how to be even better. Results are still happening." (TEJ).

Outcome: "Cognitive Enlightenment, Development in Social Relations"

"While living in an international environment, I've embraced a mindset that values adaptability and open-mindedness. This has led me to explore alternative approaches and solutions that may not align with conventional beliefs. Whether it's in communication styles, problem-solving methods, or understanding societal norms, I've learned to appreciate the richness that comes from moving away from the familiar." (KAMILA).

Outcome: "Developing a different perspective. Cognitive enlightenment"

Kamila has developed a different perspective as a result of the transformation that has occurred in herself with the effect of the environment. Cognitively enlightened, she realized the ways to develop different solutions to the problems he encountered.

"I'm stepping on my own path of life, and gaining knowledge and skill's leading me to become a version of my future self, which enables me to freedom in all aspect of my life. That's how I set out on my own path, I acquire knowledge and skills that lead me to freedom, and I share the acquired knowledge and skills with the people in the world, among people, because I believe that by doing this I help to make the world more beautiful." (ANGELA).

Outcome: "Reinventing yourself", "Recognizing your skills and abilities."

Angela feels more comfortable and free after ending her marriage. By looking at life from a different perspective, she realized that she developed more sharing relationships with the people around her. On the other hand, she is also developing herself in order to have the future as she wants.

"I considered myself a deeply introverted person having slight troubles with social interaction, constantly questioning if my opinions would not hurt the others, and feared of being viewed as weird or different.

The problem I was facing was primarily the lack of confidence and thus the prejudice of how some achievements are impossible to reach for me, some goals are out of my scope and the scarcity mindset that one person can be good at more than one thing.

I have always loved to live my life and honestly have not been through lots of struggles compared to many many others who had to deal with any sort of trauma. I do acknowledge this privilege and try to use it to help those in need. What I changed was to be more outgoing, more extroverted as it has become a huge part of my professional life. It has been a way to connect with people in others as well as my own culture." (NINA).

Outcome: "Reinventing yourself", "Realizing your skills and abilities", "Social adaptability and self-confidence".

"While I was studying, I was convinced that I had to become a primary school teacher, marry a man from my hometown (of course with a permanent, high paying job) and start a family there. This was what I was supposed to do to make everybody happy. Nonetheless, sometimes, I dreamt about becoming a "power woman", starting a business, creating something of my own and being my own boss. Of course, I kept denying those dreams and those fantasies, because it was easier to follow the path somebody else had written for me.

I sometimes experienced panic attacks, insomnia, general unhappiness, otitis, nausea, and other stuff. I used to do everything to self-sabotage myself." (FABIANA).

Outcome: "Self-criticism"

"I started my freelancing business, which is doing well. I work with creativity, and writing, which I've been passionate about since I was a child. I learnt how to take care of my self, recognize my feelings, my desires, and listen to my body. Now I can also do things that scare me: for example, learning to swim or taking a flight. I feel more confident, balanced and I enjoy socializing and spending time with people. I didn't get married, but I happily live with a loving and supporting partner, who always motivates me to go on and beyond. I learnt how to enjoy some "me time", doing yoga and meditation, dancing, spending time with good vibes people, go running, be aware of my lifestyle." (FABIANA).

Outcome: "Acquiring a new frame of reference."; "Recognition of achievements and skills"; "Self-assessment"

"During this process I did a lot of reading, studying and training both for personal and professional skills. I learnt a lot about myself and the environment I grew up in. Thanks to yoga and meditation, I developed more self awareness. As for work, I studied and experienced how to run a business, deal with clients, create a network, manage bureaucracy and finances, promote myself, and keep my vision even in challenging times and with "difficult" clients." (FABIANA).

Outcome: "Developing your skills."; "Cognitive enlightenment."

DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATIONS

The findings are discussed below in the light of theoretical information about the field and research in this field.

Discussion

Although transformational learning is perceived as re-evaluating one's circumstances and changing one's values, reference frames, beliefs and assumptions by interpreting them from a new perspective, it is actually the expressive methodological application of critical reflection (Mezirow, 2006). The necessity of an extraordinary reason, a state of crisis, a breakthrough development, and inextricable conditions for a person to engage in a transformational learning process has been frequently discussed by scientists such as Mezirow

(2006), Dirkx (2000), Kovan and Dirkx (2003). As can be understood from both the researches conducted in this field and the findings of this research, almost all of the participants stated that they were in a momentary change, crisis state or a situation that did not go as before in their lives. The dilemma situation that caused the transformation of the participants, the reasons, their analysis of this situation, and the transformation decision and results they took with an enlightenment that followed can be seen together in the table below:

Table 3.
Transformational Learning Status of the Participants

Participant	Dilemma	The reason that causes the transformation	Situation analysis, decision	Transformation
ŞİRİN	Losing her father in a traffic accident, having to work at a very young age.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Losing Relative, • Trauma 	<i>"Unfortunately, everything turned into a completely different situation. He was very young when he died in a car accident (37). It was devastating for me. I thought I would have a different life before."</i>	Living the moment, Self development,
DENİZ	Negative feelings due to separation from her husband and moving to another city.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Divorce, • Moving to another city 	<i>"Leaving my husband and moving to Izmir with my daughter. My transformation is to get a divorce and move to another city. My goal in life is to be happy, and I think if I'm happy, I can figure it all out"</i>	Interrogative personality, Self-worth
MELEK	Dilemma as a result of both the earthquake and the loss of a loved one and the fact that things are not going well.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Earthquake, • Losing Relative, • Feeling guilt 	<i>"My parents were staying with us that night. The next day, my parents would leave and go home. Not only because of the earthquake, but also because of the economic crisis in the country after the earthquake, my husband's business did not go well, he went bankrupt and had to sell his business. We lost everything."</i>	Understanding the value of time, Social cohesion, self-development
TEJ	Her mother's very controlling approach and feeling pressured.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relationships with her environment 	<i>"Because she was always in the bad mood and too much just controlling and not listening to me the way she should. I always said, that she wanted that I would be closed just in one box, she was cutting my wings, my wishes, my ideas for progress and different life that she was having."</i>	Patient, accepting everyone in their own position, optimistic, constantly self improvement
KAMIL A	Because she is an introverted character, she questions and wants to improve himself.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quarantine • Interruption of learning 	<i>"I was a very introverted person, very self-critical and self-aware. I found comfort in routine and the known. I had troubles finding individuals who resonated with me... I struggled emotionally with leaving my family and with doubting my capabilities."</i>	Social personality that makes sense of social relations, Self-discovery
ANGEL A	Separation/self-creation as a result of dissatisfaction with the relationship with the spouse.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Divorce • Questioning Life 	<i>"I used to fight against injustice differently, physically, but I realized that was wrong."</i>	Accepting people in their position, A self-improving personality that develops more sharing relationships

NINA	Fear of how she will be perceived by others	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Accepting change 	<i>"The transformation has been an ongoing process of fluid-like changes in the perception of all the events happening in life. The key has been set in embracing and accepting change and transformation as a positive aspect in self-development and self-perception."</i>	A more extroverted personality, success in business life
FABIA NA	Refusal to accept their role, willingness to develop a new way of life	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trauma 	<i>"The Summer after my graduation and my master I entered a tunnel of deep darkness and despair. Somebody called it depression, somebody else burnout. Somebody just thought I had gone crazy."</i>	A more confident personality, a successful character in business life

When the findings about the transformation process experienced by the research participants are evaluated together, it can be seen that the participants have entered a dilemma deadlock, and this situation has turned them into serious stress, distress or an effect that negatively affects their life comfort. Mezirow (2000) states that the important point in this process is to realize the impasse situation by the person, to express his discomfort and to make a change/transformation decision. It is noteworthy that after the decision taken, the participants acquired a different perspective on life and acquired a more positive and more optimistic personality.

The reasoning for why participants engage in a transformational learning process is consistent with Mezirow's (2006) view of "trauma", "extraordinary development", "crisis" or the result of an accumulation of perspectives that the person has entered the transformational learning process. When we look at the findings obtained, it is understood that all of the participants faced an inextricable situation and experienced serious trauma as a result. However, Dirkx (2000) does not agree with this view. According to him, transformational learning can also be a product of experiences gained in an ordinary everyday life.

It is understood that all of the participants who expressed their opinions in the research developed critical reflection, critical self-reflection and critical discourse with a critical approach to their own reference frames, values and beliefs. Feriver Gezer (2010), Kaşkaya (2013), Cekin (2013) and Reichenbach (2015) found that people who went through the transformational learning process had a significant improvement in their critical reflection skills, a change in their worldview, a positive improvement in their vital skills, and that people who completed the process described themselves better and more positively than before.

Deniz, one of the participants, said: *"I was very critical of myself for why I shut myself down. How can I take responsibility for a child on my own?";* Melek's *"I was very friendly. I knew everyone as myself. I was very giving. I realized that the people I knew were my friends weren't actually my friends.";* Tej's *"I always said, that she wanted "that I would be closed just in one box, she was cutting my wings, my wishes, my ideas for progress and different life that she was having."* And Angela's *"But in some way I recognized that I am not happy inside me to serve others. And at some point my inner voice started to be more loud day by day, when I realized I was living in an environment that doesn't support my ability to live my purpose."* The findings that their statements seriously criticize their views or frames of reference show that they are compatible with the research of Mezirow (2003, 2006), Cranton (1996, 2000), Akpınar (2010), Akçay (2012), Şen and Şahin (2017).

Cranton (1996), Mezirow (2003), King (2002) and Dirkx (2006) have evaluated the stages or stages of the transformational learning process. When the different views are considered together, it is understood that the ten-stage view expressed by Mezirow (2006) is generally accepted. When the opinions of the participants are examined, it is understood that all of them have gained experience in the transformational learning process by going through these ten stages. All eight participants completed the transformational learning process by passing through all ten stages. In some studies, it is mentioned that some people who go through a similar process pass only a few of these stages, while others skip some steps.

Researchers attribute the stages that these people skipped or did not pass to the fact that they lived before entering the process. In their research, Tosun and Bahar (2016) state that some people could not complete the process, and that this was a result of the people's experiences in the previous process or the fact that the people who supported them in the process did not play an active role enough. Akdağ Kurnaz (2018) reached a similar finding and concluded that some participants only made a transformation in the stages of dilemma, critical evaluation, self-evaluation and realization in an experimental study conducted in an experimental design. Despite these studies, according to the results obtained from the data obtained by Marrow (2022) through face-to-face and online interviews, it was concluded that all participants who entered the transformational learning process passed all ten stages. When the researches conducted in the light of these discussions are evaluated together, it can be concluded that all ten stages are generally exceeded, but some participants cannot pass some steps due to various reasons.

While falling into dilemma, which is an important stage of transformational learning, is seen in some of the participants in a real sense, it is understood that they experience a dilemma from their discourse, although it is not so obvious in others. Although Şirin, one of the participants, says, *"I did not have a dilemma,"* she mentions that she could not accept her father's death. Although Şirin herself does not realize it, it is clearly seen that she is in a serious dilemma. Nina, one of the participants, said that she had a direct dilemma: *"The dilemma of being perceived the way I expected was to put myself through the situations I was fearing."* she expressed with the statement. Brock (2010), in his research examining the experiences of those who went through the transformational learning process, found that the vast majority of participants experienced "confusion" at first. Altay (2020)'s finding that teachers who participated in a study made a statement that they experienced a direct dilemma in the transformational learning process is consistent with this research.

As a result of the critical discourse developed towards the frames of reference that the person has, it has been determined that the stage of critiquing epistemic, socio-linguistic and psychic assumptions is experienced by all participants. This has taken the form of critical reflection, critical self-reflection and critical discourse. The results obtained are supported by the research results of Reichenbach (2015), Akdağ Kurnaz (2018) and Altay (2020). In both the findings and the findings of these researchers, it was evaluated that a "critical discourse" played an active role in the realization of the transformation. In this case, it can be stated that the participants are not satisfied with the situation they are in, they develop a critical discourse and their perspective transformation begins. Şirin, one of the participants, said, *"At first, I was always ignoring my own wishes. My priority was always my loved ones, and if I had my mind now, I would make an effort for my own life."* Then, she makes a criticism that the dominant thought is that priority is given to loved ones and not to himself. Offering a similar self-criticism, Melek said, *"I was very friendly. I knew everyone as myself. I was very giving. I realized that the people I knew were my friends weren't actually my friends."* She states that the reference to "being optimistic" was abused, and that he himself realized this. Speaking in support of this, Angela expressed her own self-criticism by saying, *"But in some way, I recognized that I am not happy inside me to serve others. And at some point my inner voice started to be more loud day by day, when I realized I was living in an environment that doesn't support my ability to live my purpose."* sentences. These data show that the participants criticized the frames of reference they had and acquired new discourses. These findings are consistent with a study conducted by Altay (2020) on teacher education. Because it was concluded that the majority of the participating teachers made a statement that their perspectives changed by criticizing the reference frames they had. It is understood that the findings obtained are compatible with the research findings reached in the literature review.

Receiving information that others are going through similar transformations or sharing their own experiences with others was observed in some participants, while others were not even aware of it. From the findings obtained;

"In discussion with fellow international learners, it became apparent that the dilemmas we face, whether linguistic, cultural, academic or emotional are interconnected" (KAMILA) and

"Only later on in life and also mostly online have I found people who were speaking of very similar aspects of life as I have been experiencing. Only then I found people who might not follow the traditional routes in life biased spiritually, culturally, based on religious or social beliefs and predispositions." (NINA).

Their opinions are that sharing is an example and helps them get through the process easily. Some participants, on the other hand, shared their experiences with others but did not agree with their views, saying, *"If you look at me, according to the people around me, the reason for my divorce is not a real reason. No one knows what it is when you don't live in it."* (DENİZ). they expressed it in their words. Angela, on the other hand, inferred that there may be similar examples instead of sharing, *"But I have never compared myself or my relationship with other's, because each one of us is unique, has their own issues."* expresses it with the explanation. In a study conducted by Şahin-İzmirli (2012), it was determined that some of the teachers who had transformational learning experience benefited from the experiences of others by sharing, while some of them benefited from the experiences of others only by observing. It is adopted that the views on this subject are of different structures, that they are shared with others, but that they only have the feature of an alternative idea in making healthy decisions. Feriver Gezer (2010), on the other hand, found that sharing experiences accelerates and positively affects transformational learning.

It was determined that all of the participants who went through the transformation process acquired new roles and experiences and relationships. It is also supported by different studies that people who are in transformation are in search of what they can do to get out of the situation. In their research, Cekin (2013) and Yurdakul, İzmirli and Örün (2015) found that people who go through the transformational learning process search for new roles and prefer the most suitable one for them in order to realize this transformation.

When it was examined whether the participants who realized that they had entered the transformation process made a plan for the new process, it was understood that all of them made a plan. However, it was determined that this plan was detailed in some participants and a simple decision in others. However, some studies show that a good plan has been made for transformational learning to take place. Among the participants, Şirin's time for herself to learn new things and focus on developing her talents and skills, Deniz's efforts to change cities and improve both her business life and talent-skills, Melek's decision to attend courses to improve herself and to be in social environments, Tej's efforts to improve relations with her mother, Angela's determination of ways to improve her self-skills, Kamila's career development plans, Fabiana's decision to realize her work and social life plans, and Nina's determined plan for her life show that people who enter the transformational learning process have had a great deal of planning. Özçelik (2019) supports the research with the findings that people are uncomfortable with the situation they are in, and that they sometimes make a transformation plan in search of escape and sometimes innovation.

In the process of implementing the plan, it was understood that the participants acquired new knowledge and skills. Although some participants started and ended their skill acquisition processes, it was understood that some of them considered "new skill acquisition" conceptually and adopted it as an ongoing situation, so they often continued to acquire new skills. Yeboah (2012) reached results that supported the results obtained in his research and found that both purposeful and non-purposeful gains were obtained. Şirin's development of her social network, Deniz's dancing and musical instrument playing, her education in art, Melek's participation in sports courses and self-improvement in sewing and embroidery, Tej's reading books and increasing their knowledge, Kamila's developing their individual knowledge and skills, Angela's improving their skills in finance and social relations show that the participants who enter the transformation process acquire new knowledge and skills in the process. Çimen (2013), Uyanık (2016), Çimen and Yılmaz (2014), Epcapan (2018) concluded that people who went through the transformational learning process acquired new knowledge and behaviors, while Merriam and Ntseane (2008), Ay (2008) and Akçay (2012) concluded that these people acquired a new personality and their perspectives on life differed. These findings

are also consistent with the stages mentioned in Mezirow's (2000) transformational learning steps.

It was understood that the new skills gained were tried temporarily by all participants, but while this trial resulted in negative results for some participants, it led to the development of self-confidence in others. One of the participants, Deniz's learning by trying the knowledge and skills she has gained and feeling productive, which she emphasized the most during the transformation process, enabled her to successfully complete transformational learning. This has developed self-confidence in him. Having had a similar experience, Kamila has been open to different approaches and solutions after experiencing her new role with an open mind, and she has been one of the winners in the end, caring about whether these approaches and solutions are actually compatible with traditional beliefs.

After each trial, it is understood that the transformation process progresses healthily by experiencing a self-confidence formation in all of the participants. Tej's understanding that the decisions she made and the actions she took during the transformation process were successful, created self-confidence in her, and it was understood that Nina's new roles with the transformation led to the possible development of self-confidence that was appreciated by the society. Franz (2002), Yurdakul, İzmirli and Örün (2015), Özçelik (2019) found that the personalities of the transformed people improved and their self-confidence increased thanks to the critical skills and new roles they acquired.

When the findings were examined, it was stated that all of the participants had gained new gains and all of them had "understanding the value of life", "accepting everyone in their own position", "being optimistic", "becoming conscious", and having an understanding and extroverted personality. When these achievements were examined together, it was understood that they were grouped as "old" and "new" by all participants. This situation has been interpreted as the transformation has taken place.

When the stages of transformational learning were discussed, it was understood that all of them passed the ten phases mentioned by Mezirow (2006), and that the experiences in the process, the achievements and the research findings were compatible with the research findings of Akpınar (2010), Akçay (2012), Uyanık (2016), Şen and Şahin (2017) and Akdağ Kurnaz (2018). It was understood that the experiences of the participants during the transformational learning process were compatible with the theoretical structure of the TLT and were similar to the information determined in the literature.

Conclusion

The findings obtained in the research on how the transformational learning process takes place in the lives of adults, who are transformational learners, were discussed with the theoretical data obtained in the literature and the findings and results obtained from the researches, and the following conclusions were reached:

- Transformational learning is a methodological approach that allows adults to continue their lives by transforming.
- Transformational learning has positively affected adults' ability to get rid of the dilemmas they experience due to vital factors.
- Although transformational learning continues in different people, at different duration, acceleration and form, it has taken place in a structure that is in accordance with the theoretical literature.
- The negativity of their previous lives, loss of profession or skills, and feeling worthless played an active role in adults' entry into the transformational learning process.
- Adults have faced dilemmas, crises, and confusions before embarking on the transformational learning process.
- Adults who entered the transformational learning process benefited from the experiences of people who have gone through similar paths on how to get out of the situations they are in, by observing or listening to them.

- Adults who entered the transformational learning process changed their previous beliefs, cultures, habits or prior knowledge in the process of overcoming the dilemmas they encountered.
- When adults who entered the transformational learning process criticized the frames of reference they had previously applied, they experienced an enlightenment by acquiring critical thinking skills.
- After adults have gone through the transformational learning process, they have changed their previous worldviews and perspectives.
- After the transformational learning process, adults have acquired a personality that is more understanding, temperate, accepts everyone in their own position, and values life more.
- Adults who have gone through the transformational learning process have gained critical thinking skills.
- While some adults enter the transformational learning process as planned, others enter as an accumulation of experiences.
- Adults who have had a transformational learning experience have differentiated their lives into "old" and "new".

Implications

Based on the results obtained in the research, suggestions for researchers and practitioners are listed below:

For researchers;

- It can be investigated as a comparison of how the transformational learning process takes place in different professions,
- Enrich the theoretical literature on how the transformational learning process takes place in professional development or personal life,
- How social culture is a factor in the transformational learning of adults can be investigated with quantitative research designs,
- Factors affecting the transformational learning times of adults can be investigated,
- Those who have similar situations and those who have undergone the transformational learning process and those who have not can be investigated by conducting experimental studies.

For practitioners;

- More support can be given to academic research and application projects related to TLT,
- Teacher training programs of universities can include courses with theoretical and practical activities for TLT, so that the next generation of teachers who will work in adult education institutions can understand the transformational learning experience of adults and plan and carry out more effective educational activities for adults,
- The adult populations of developing and developed countries are increasing rapidly and state governments attach importance to educational activities for adult learning. Increasing the knowledge and skills of adults is also extremely important for the development of society. Both adult non-governmental organizations and official adult institutions can add the TLT philosophy to their training programs,
- Adult educators can create an inclusive, open, and democratic learning environment where they can foster transformational learning processes in adult learners and where learners can feel more comfortable or free to critically articulate their own past experiences.

To Develop Curriculum,

- With transformational learning, it has been observed that adults develop changes in their personalities and thinking skills very effectively and develop both individual and social adaptations, so while developing adult education programs, individual and social

activities can be included where adults can share their individual experiences and question adults' interests, needs and past experiences,

- TLT concepts such as critical thinking, critical discourse, critical self-reflection, developing different perspectives and frames of reference can be integrated into educational programs,
- Adults' educational program contents may include visual and auditory materials that question meaning structures and meaning perspectives,
- Simulation techniques can be developed that will enable adults to develop rational discourse in the learning-teaching processes of educational programs,
- Critical self-reflection of adults can also be taken into account during the evaluation phase of adult education programs,
- As a result of the research, it has been observed that as a result of transformational learning of adults, they develop desired behaviors. TLT applications can be integrated in adult education programs to be developed by training program developers.

References

- [1]. Akçay, C. (2012). Dönüşümsel öğrenme kuramı ve yetişkin eğitiminde dönüşüm. *Millî Eğitim Dergisi*, 42(196), 5-19.
- [2]. Akdağ Kurnaz, E. (2018). *Dönüştürücü öğrenme kuramına göre İngilizce dersinde hazırlanmış öğrenme etkinliklerinin üniversite öğrencilerinin bakış açısı dönüşümlerine incelenmesi*, (Yayınlanmamış doktora tezi). Eskişehir Osmangazi Üniversitesi, Sağlık Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Eskişehir.
- [3]. Akpınar, B. (2010). Transformatif öğrenme kuramı: Dönüşerek ve değişerek öğrenme. *Anadolu Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 10(2), 185-198.
- [4]. Altay, Ö. (2020). *Dönüşümsel öğrenme kuramı temelli çok-kültürlü öğretmen eğitimi programının hizmet öncesi öğretmenlerin bakış açısı dönüşümüne etkisinin incelenmesi*, (yayınlanmamış doktora tezi), Yakınođu Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Lefkoşa/Kuzey Kıbrıs Türk Cumhuriyeti
- [5]. Avrupa Komisyonu Kararı. (2002, Mart 15,16). <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/media/20939/71025.pdf>
- [6]. Ay, F. (2008). *Aile eğitimi kurslarının yetişkin eğitimi bağlamında etkililiğinin değerlendirilmesi*, (Yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi). Bartın Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Bartın
- [7]. Ayhan, S. (2009). *Yetişkin eğitimi; Paulo Freire: Yaşamı, eğitim felsefesi ve uygulaması üzerine*. (Ed.: A. Yıldız- M. Uysal). İstanbul: Kalkedon Yayınları.
- [8]. Baumgartner, L. (2003). Transformative learning: Fundamental concepts. In L. Baumgartner (Ed.) *Adult learning theory: A premier. Information series* (ss. 23-28). Columbus, OH: Center on Education and Training for Employment.
- [9]. Brock, S. (2010). Measuring the importance of precursor steps to transformative learning. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 60(2), 122-142.
- [10]. Candy, P. C. (1991). *Self-direction for lifelong learning*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- [11]. Chaves, C. A. (2008). Adult Learners and the dialectical process: A validating constructivist approach to learning transfer and application. *Online Journal of Workforce Education and Development*, 3(1), 1-14.
- [12]. Clark, C. ve Dirks, J. (2000) Moving beyond a unitary self: a reflective dialogue. In: Wilson A, Hayes E (Eds) *Handbook of adult and continuing education* (pp 101-116). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- [13]. Cranton, P. ve Kasl, E. (2012). A Response to Michael Newman's "calling transformative learning into question: Some mutinous thoughts". *Adult Education Quarterly*, 62(4), 393-398
- [14]. Cranton, P. (1994). *Understanding and promoting transformative learning: A guide for educators of adults*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- [15]. Cranton, P. (1996). *Professional development as transformative learning: New perspectives for teachers of adults*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- [16]. Cranton, P. (2000). Individual differences and transformative learning. *Learning as transformation: Critical Perspectives on a Theory in Progress*, 181-204.
- [17]. Cranton, P. (2002). Teaching for transformation. *New Directions For Adult And Continuing Education*, 93, 63-72.
- [18]. Cranton, P. ve Roy, M. (2003). When the bottom falls out of the bucket: Toward a holistic perspective on transformative learning. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 1(2), 86-98.
- [19]. Creswell, J.W. (2013) *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. (4th Edition), London: Sage Publications, Inc.
- [20]. Creswell, W. J. (2018). *Nitel araştırma yöntemleri: Beş yaklaşıma göre nitel araştırma ve araştırma deseni*. (S.B. Demir, Çev.). Ankara: Siyasal Kitabevi
- [21]. Çekin, A. (2013). Öğrenen toplumun oluşturulmasında dönüştürücü öğrenme teorisinin din eğitimine yansımaları. *Bartın Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 2(1), 97-106.
- [22]. Çimen, O. (2013). Dönüşümsel öğrenme kuramı. G. Ekici ve M. Güven (Ed.) *Yeni öğrenme ve öğretme yaklaşımları ve uygulama örnekleri* içinde (ss. 317-338). Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- [23]. Çimen, O. ve Yılmaz, M. (2014). Dönüşümsel öğrenme kuramına dayalı çevre eğitiminin biyoloji öğretmen adaylarının çevre sorunlarına yönelik algılarına etkisi. *Bartın University Journal of Faculty of Education*, 3 (1), 339-359.
- [24]. Darkenwald, G. G. ve Merriam, S. B. (1982). *Adult education: Foundation of practice*. New York, NY: Harper and Row Publishers.
- [25]. Dewey, J. (1986). Experience and education. *The Educational Forum* 50(3), 241-252.

- [26]. Dirkx, J. M. (1987). Patriarchal consciousness and the transformative adult learning group. In S.J. Levine, R.J. Smith, ve J.E. Snoddy (Eds.). *Proceedings of the midwest research to practice conference in adult and continuing education*. East Lansing, MI: Michigan State University.
- [27]. Dirkx, J. M. (1998). Transformative learning theory in the practice of adult education. *Pennsylvania Association for Adult Continuing Education Journal of Lifelong Learning*, 7, 1-14.
- [28]. Dirkx, J. (2000). After the burning bush: Transformative learning as imaginative engagement with everyday experience. *Challenges of Practice: Transformative Learning in Action*, 247-252.
- [29]. Dirkx, J. M. (2001). The power of feelings: Emotion, imagination, and the construction of meaning in adult learning. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 2001(89), 63-72.
- [30]. Dirkx, J. M. (2006). Engaging emotions in adult learning: A Jungian perspective on emotion and transformative learning. *New directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 2006(109), 15-26.
- [31]. Dirkx, J. M. (2008). *Adult learning and the emotional self*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- [32]. Epcapan, E. (2018). *Dönüşümsel öğrenme modelinin 6. Sınıfların bilimleri dersinde öğrencilerin eleştirel düşünme eğilimlerine ve bilişötesi farkındalıklarına etkisi*, (yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi), Siirt Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Siirt.
- [33]. Feriver Gezer, Ş. (2011). *Sürdürülebilirliğin hizmetiçi eğitim ile okulöncesi eğitime entegre edilmesi: Dönüştürücü öğrenmeye yönelik bir çaba*. (yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi). Orta Doğu Teknik Üniversitesi, Sağlık Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Ankara.
- [34]. Franz, N.K. (2003). Transformative learning in extension staff partnerships: Facilitating personal, joint, and organizational change. *Journal of Extension* 41(2) Available at: http://works.bepress.com/nancy_franz/10/
- [35]. Hartree, A. (1984). Malcolm Knowles' theory of andragogy: A critique. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 3(3), 203-210.
- [36]. Heidegger, M. (1962). *Being and time*. New York: State University of New York Press.
- [37]. Hof, C. (2017). Is there space for Bildung and transformative learning in the lifelong learning discourse? In A. Laros, T. Fuhr, ve E.W. Taylor (Eds), *Transformative learning meets Bildung: An international exchange* (pp. 269-278). Rotterdam: Sense Publishers. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6300-797-9_22.
- [38]. Husserl, E. (1983). *Ideas I: General introduction to a pure phenomenology*. Çev. F. Kersten, The Hague & Boston & London: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.
- [39]. Illeris, K. (2014). *Transformative learning and identity*. London: Routledge.
- [40]. İlik, M. Ü. (2022). *Dönüşümsel Öğrenme Kuramı Bağlamında Yetişkinlerin Dönüşümü*, (yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi). Mersin Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Mersin.
- [41]. Jarvis, P. (1987). *Adult learning in the social context*. London: Croom Helm.
- [42]. Jarvis, P. (2004). *Adult education and lifelong learning: Theory and practice* (3rd ed.). London and New York: Routledge/Falmer Press.
- [43]. Jarvis, P. (2006). *Towards a comprehensive theory of human learning*. London and New York: Routledge/Falmer Press.
- [44]. Jarvis, P. (2014). From adult education to lifelong learning and beyond, *Comparative Education*, 50:1, 45-57.
- [45]. King, K. P. (2002). A journey of transformation: A model of educators' learning experiences in educational technology. In J. M. Pettitt & R. P. Francis (Eds.), *Proceedings of the 43rd annual adult education research conference* (pp. 195-200). North Carolina State University.
- [46]. Kitchenham, A. (2008). The evolution of John Mezirow's transformative learning theory. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 6(104), 10-123.
- [47]. Knowles, M. S. (1968). Andragogy, not pedagogy. *Adult Leadership*, 16(10), 350-352.
- [48]. Knowles, M. S. (1980). *The modern practice of adult education: From pedagogy to andragogy*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Cambridge Adult Education.
- [49]. Knowles, M. S. (1996). *Yetişkin öğrenenler gözardı edilen bir kesim*. (S. Ayhan, Çev.). Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Basımevi.
- [50]. Knowles, M. S., Holton, E. F. ve Swanson, R. A. (2015). *Yetişkin eğitimi*. (O. Gündüz, Çev.). İstanbul: Kaknüs Yayınları.
- [51]. Kovan, J. T. ve Dirkx, J. M. (2003). "Being called awake": The role of transformative learning in the lives of environmental activists. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 53(2), 99-118.
- [52]. Kucukaydin, I. ve Cranton, P. (2012). Critically questioning the discourse of transformative learning theory. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 63(1), 43 - 56
- [53]. Merriam, S. (2004). *The changing landscape of adult learning theory*. In J. Comings, B. Garner, & C. Smith (Eds.), *Review of adult learning and literacy: Connecting research, policy, and practice* (pp. 199-220). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- [54]. Merriam, S. B. ve Brockett, R. G. (1997). *The profession and practice of adult education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- [55]. Merriam, S. B. (2001). Andragogy and self-directed learning: Pillars of adult learning theory. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 2001(89), 3-14.
- [56]. Merriam, S. B. (2006). Transformational learning and HIV-positive young adults. *Theoretical Frameworks in Qualitative Research*, 1, 23-38.
- [57]. Merriam, S. B., Caffarella, R. S. ve Baumgartner, L. M. (2007). *Learning in adulthood*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- [58]. Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- [59]. Mezirow, J. ve Associates. (2000). *Learning as transformation: A theory-in-progress*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- [60]. Mezirow, J. ve Taylor, E. W. (2009). *Transformative learning in practice*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- [61]. Mezirow, J. (1975). *Education for perspective transformation: Women's reentry programs in community colleges*. New York: Columbia University.
- [62]. Mezirow, J. (1977). Perspective transformation. *Stud. Adult Educ*, 9, 153-164.
- [63]. Mezirow, J. (1978). Perspective transformation. *Adult education*, 28(2), 100-110.
- [64]. Mezirow, J. (1978a). *Education for perspective transformation: Women's re-entry programs in community college*. New York: Columbia University.
- [65]. Mezirow, J. (1978b). Perspective transformation. *Adult Education*, 28(2), 100-110.
- [66]. Mezirow, J. (1981). A critical theory of adult learning and education. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 32(1), 3-24.
- [67]. Mezirow, J. (1990). *Fostering critical reflection in adulthood* (pp. 1-20). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- [68]. Mezirow, J. (1989). Transformation theory and social action: a response to colard and law. *Adult education quarterly*, 39(3), 169-175
- [69]. Mezirow, J. (1991). *Transformative dimensions of adult learning*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- [70]. Mezirow, J. (1994) Understanding transformation theory, *Adult Education Quarterly* 44, 222-232.
- [71]. Mezirow, J. (1996). Contemporary paradigms of learning. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 46(3), 158-172.

- [72]. Mezirow, J. (1997). Transformative learning: Theory to practice. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 1997(74), 5-12.
- [73]. Mezirow, J. (2000). Learning to think like an adult. In J. Mezirow & Associates (Eds.), *Learning as transformation: Critical perspectives on a theory in progress*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- [74]. Mezirow, J. (2003). Transformative learning as discourse. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 1(1), 58-63.
- [75]. Mezirow, J. (2006). An overview on transformative learning. In P. Sutherland & J. Crowther (Eds.), *Lifelong learning: Concepts and contexts*. London: Routledge.
- [76]. Mezirow, J. (2009). Transformative learning theory. In J. Mezirow, E. W. Taylor, & Associates (Eds.), *Transformative learning in practice*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- [77]. Mezirow, J. (2018). An overview on transformative learning. In K. Illeris (ed.), *Contemporary Theories of Learning: Learning Theorists...In Their Own Words*. New York: Routledge.
- [78]. Miles, M.B. ve Huberman, A.M. (2016). *Nitel veri analizi* (S. Akbaba Altun ve A. Ersoy, Çev.). Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- [79]. Moustakas, C. (1994). *Phenomenological research methods*. Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- [80]. OECD/CERI. (Eds.). (1973). *Recurrent education: A strategy for lifelong learning. A clarifying report*. Paris: OECD
- [81]. Özçelik, M.Ö. (2019). *Kaçkar dağlarında dönüşümsel öğrenmeye bir bakış: Turistlerin seyahat deneyimlerini anlamaya yönelik bir çalışma*, (yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi). Akdeniz Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Antalya
- [82]. Patton, Q. M. (2014). *Nitel araştırma ve değerlendirme yöntemleri* (M. Bütün ve S. B. Demir, Çev.). Ankara: Pegem.
- [83]. Penirci, G. (2014). *Yetişkin eğitimi kurslarının yetişkin eğitimi ve yetişkin öğrenen ilke ve özelliklerine göre incelenmesi*, (yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi), Marmara Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, İstanbul
- [84]. Piaget, J. (1964). Part I: Cognitive development in children: Piaget development and learning. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 2(3), 176-186.
- [85]. Reichenbach, M.R. (2015). *Fostering transformative learning in an informal collaborative process* (unpublished doctoral dissertation). University Of Minnesota.
- [86]. Rose, P., Beeby, J. ve Parker, D. (1995). Academic rigour in the lived experience of researchers using phenomenological methods in nursing. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 21(6), 1123-1129.
- [87]. Şahin, M. (2016). The two and a half learning model: A consequence of academic dishonesty. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 7(18), 20-25.
- [88]. Şahin-İzmirli, Ö. (2012). *Dönüştürücü öğrenme kuramı açısından öğretmen adaylarının bilgi ve iletişim teknolojileri entegrasyonu uygulamaları*, (yayınlanmamış doktora tezi). Anadolu Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Eskişehir.
- [89]. Şen, E., ve Şahin, H. (2017). Dönüşümsel öğrenme kuramı: Baskın paradigmayı yıkmak. *Tıp Eğitimi Dünyası*, 16(49), 39-48.
- [90]. Taylor, E. W. (1997). Building upon the theoretical debate: A critical review of the empirical studies of Mezirow's transformative learning theory. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 48(1), 34-59.
- [91]. Taylor, E. W. (1998). *The Theory and practice of transformative learning: A Critical Review*. http://ericacve.org/mp_taylor_01.asp
- [92]. Taylor, E. W. (2007). An update of transformative learning theory: A critical review of the empirical research (1999-2005). *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 26(2), 173-191.
- [93]. Taylor, E. W. (2008). Transformative learning theory: New directions for adult and continuing education. *Special Issue: Third update on Adult Learning Theory*, (119), 5-15.
- [94]. Taylor, E.W. ve Cranton, P. (2013). A theory in progress? [Issues in transformative learning]. *European Journal for Research on the Education and Learning of Adults*, 4(1), 33-47.
- [95]. Tosun, Ü. ve Bahar, M. (2016). Yetişkin eğitiminde görev yapan eğitimcilerin eğitimlik rollerinin dönüştürücü öğrenme kuramı temelinde incelenmesi. *Eğitim ve Öğretim Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 5(3), 20-32.
- [96]. UNESCO. (2005). *Guidelines for inclusion: Ensuring access to education for all*. United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation. http://www.ibe.unesco.org/sites/default/files/Guidelines_for_Inclusion_UNESCO_2006.pdf
- [97]. Uyanık, G. (2016). Effect of environmental education based on transformational learning theory on perceptions towards environmental problems and permanency of learning. *International Electronic Journal of Environmental Education*, 6(2), 126-140.
- [98]. Yeboah, K. A. (2012). *Factors that promote transformative learning experiences of international graduate-level learners* (unpublished graduate theses and dissertations). University of South Florida, USA.
- [99]. Yıldırım, A. ve Şimşek, H. (2018). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri*. Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.
- [100]. Yurdakul, I.K., İzmirli, Ö. Ş. ve Örün, Ö. (2015). Öğretim elemanı teknoloji danışmanlığı: Dönüştürücü öğrenme kuramı bakış açısı ile mesleki gelişim sürecini inceleme. *Eğitim Teknolojisi Kuram ve Uygulama*. 5(1), 89-110.